## REPORT OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION FOLLOWING THE ASSEMENT OF COMPLAIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS FOR ACCREDITATION MASTER 'S DEGREES PROGRAMME IN MEDICAL AND HEALTH PROFESSIONS EDUCATION

## JSC «KAZAKH MEDICLA UNIVERSITY OF CONTINUING EDUCATION» MASTER'S DEGREES PROGRAMME IN NURSING

## 1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

According to the ECAQA Order No. 34 dated 29.04. 2019, an External Expert Commission (EEC) was formed to assess the activities of the Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education for compliance with the Standards for Accreditation Master's Degrees Programme in Medical And Health Professions Education with the following membership:



## **External Expert Commission Chairperson**

BALMUKHANOVA AYGUL VLADIMIROVNA, M.D., professor, associate member of National Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Head of the Department of Science and Innovation of National Medical University JSC tel.+77017885264 e-mail: bav\_med@mail.ru



## **International expert**

POZDEEVA TATYANA VASILIEVNA M.D., professor, Head of Department of Economics, Management and Medical Law Dean of the Faculty of Preventive Medicine and Faculty of Higher Nursing Education of Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education "Volga Research Medical University" of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation tel. +7 910 38 68 206 e-mail: pozdeevatv@inbox.ru



National academic expert KALIEVA SHOLPAN SABATAEVNA Candidate of Medical Science, assistant professor, Head of the Department of Clinical Pharmacology and Evidence-Based Medicine NCJSC "Karaganda Medical University" tel.+77078649418 e-mail: <u>sholpan\_ks@mail.ru</u>







**Expert – Representative of practical healthcare** 

ABDRASULOV RASHID BOLATOVICH, Candidate of Medical Science, anesthesiologist-resuscitator National Scientific Center of Phthisiopulmonology of Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan Tel. +77029842448 e-mail: rashid.001@mail.ru

## **Expert - Master's Degree Student**

SYZDYKOVA AZIZA BIRZHANKYZY 1-st year Master's degree student in speciality "Public Health" of NPI "Kazakh-Russian medical University" tel.+77477987721 e-mail: <u>Birzhankyzy@mail.ru</u>

ECAQA observer SARSENBAEVA SAULE SERGAZIEVNA M.D., MBA, professor Director General of Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care Tel. +77013291665 e-mail: info@ecaqa.org The EEC report contains an assessment of Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education JSC for compliance with the the Standards for Accreditation Master's Degrees Programme in Medical And Health Professions Education, and recommendations of the EEC for further improvement.

#### 2. General part of the EEC final report

# 2.1 Presentation of JSC Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education

The university was established as the "Almaty State Institute of Postgraduate Medical Education" by the Decree of the Council of Ministers of the USSR No. 883 dated August 17, 1963. In 1992, it was reorganized into the "Kazakh State Institute of Postgraduate Medical Education" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

In 2010, the institute changed its organizational and legal form by transferring to REM, gained greater independence. In this regard, and in order to improve the education system, the institute switched to year-round training of professionals.

By the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated May 16, 2014 No. 501 RSE on REM "ASIPME" was reorganized into JSC "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education".

Possession and use rights of the state-owned shares of KazMUCE JSC in the amount of 100% of the share capital until December 23, 2015 was exercised by the SI "Committee of State Property and Privatization of the Ministry of Finance of the Republic of Kazakhstan", at present 100% of the shares belong to the Medical Center SANA LLP.

In June 2016, KazMUCE successfully passed the State certification. On June 10, 2016 it received institutional accreditation certificate No. AA0044, for the period: 10.06.2016-10.06.2019. On July 4, 2016, the University successfully passed the specialized accreditation of IAAR for 27 of residency specialties and 3 of Master's degree (for a period of 5 years). On May 29, 2017, KazMUCE JSC successfully passed the specialized accreditation of IQAA for 4 specialties of residency and 1 of Master's degree in "Nursing" for a period of 2 years, as it was a primary accreditation. On May 21, 2018, it successfully passed the specialized accreditation of IQAA for 2 specialized accreditation.

Educational activities at the university were carried out on the basis of a state license with annexes issued by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan on January 10, 2002, license AA No. 000603 for the right to conduct educational activities in the sphere of postgraduate professional education with additions dated October 12, 2006, July 16. 2008 and September 27, 2008, June 2, 2010, and June 30, 2010 with no expiration date. In connection with the reorganization of the RSE on REM "ASIPME" into KazMUCE JSC, the state license with the annexes was renewed on 03.12.2015, registration number KZ52LAA00006249, with no expiration date. In 2019 in accordance with the order dated October 17, 2018 No. 569 "On approval of the classifier of training areas with higher and postgraduate education" annexes to the license were reissued for residency specialties (Annex No. 020 dated 03.28.2019), Master's degree (Annex No. 021 dated 28.03.2019), PhD (Annex No. 22 dated 28.03.2019), Bachelor's degree (Annex No. 023 dated 03.28.2019).

The University has a certificate of accreditation of scientific and scientifictechnical activities issued by the MES RK dated November 3, 2014, registration No. 004262, series MK, for taking part in the competition of scientific and (or) scientific and technical activities at the expense of the state budget of the Republic of Kazakhstan; and also has a certificate of conformity of the quality management system in relation to educational activities in the sphere of postgraduate professional education, retraining and advanced training of doctors ST RK ISO 9001-2015 "Quality Management System Requirements" dated December 13, 2016, valid until December 9, 2019.

At the present, KazMUCE JSC is the only university among the medical ones in the country, which has been providing additional professional education services for over 50 years.

KazMUCE JSC has its own logo, company name and brand mark, as well as stamps in the state and Russian languages, letterhead and other reference details.

Important regulatory documents establishing the guarantee of labor rights and freedoms of employees, the creation of favorable working conditions for them, are collective and labor contracts, the Rules of labor regulations for employees and the Internal Regulations of students.

The relationship between students and the University is governed by the Charter and agreements on the provision of educational services, determining the level of education received, the period of study, the amount of tuition fees and other conditions.

The main task of KazMUCE JSC is to create the necessary conditions for obtaining additional, higher and postgraduate professional education, aimed at the professional development of the individual on the basis of national and universal values.

One of the main aspects (or directions) of the University's activities is to meet the needs of the University and the national health care system for qualified healthcare professionals and highly qualified scientific and pedagogical staff by improving the system of continuing professional development of health personnel, introducing innovative technologies in healthcare, integrating education, science and practical health care (the Charter of KazMUCE JSC approved by the decision of the only shareholder "KazMUCE" dated 27.03.2017)

## 2.2 Previous accreditation

On May 29, 2017, KazMUCE JSC passed the accreditation of the Master's degree program in "Nursing" in the IQAA and received a certificate for a period of 2 years.

2.3 Analysis of the report on the institutional self-assessment of the JSC "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" for compliance with the Standards for Accreditation Master's Degrees Programme in "Nursing" for medical organizations

The report on specialized self-assessment of Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education for compliance with the standards of Master's degree educational program in "Nursing" is presented on 144 pages, excluding applications. It is characterized by the completeness, structuredness and internal unity of information provided by the accredited medical education organization. The report is gone with a cover letter signed by acting rector- chairperson of the board, professor Doskozhaeva Saule, confirming the adequacy of the information and data contained in the report.

The report was drawn up in accordance with the Self-Assessment Manual and fully complies with the Accreditation Standards for Educational Programs of Medical Education Organizations developed by ECAQA. There is a list of members of the internal commission for self-assessment, indicating the responsibility of each of them (13 people in total), information about the university representative responsible for conducting institutional self-assessment - Doskozhaeva S.T., vice-rector for academic activities. The chairman of the working group on preparation for institutional accreditation is Doskozhaeva S.T., vice-rector for academic activities - member of the Board.

Specialized self-assessment of Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education conducted on the basis of order No. 51 - OD dated 02.22.2019.

A certain work was done by the working group on the preparation of the selfassessment report: the key areas of activity and objects for the implementation of the Master's degree educational program in "Nursing" were analyzed, the necessary information was collected in accordance with the standards of specialized accreditation; a thorough analysis of methodological and educational materials was carried out; their content is reflected in the report The content of the Self-Assessment Report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA Specialized Accreditation Standards and includes a description of strengths and areas for improvement for each of the 9 standards.

The database, the annexes are presented sequentially, there are references to them in the text of the report, but not in full, not everywhere in the text there are references to the numbers of the minutes of the deliberative bodies. The report is written skillfully, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, the annexes and tables contain references in the text and have continuous numbering.

3. Analysis of compliance with the Standards for Accreditation Master's Degrees Programme in Medical And Health Professions Education based on the results of the external evaluation of Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education JSC and a review of each standard strong points

#### **Standard 1: Mission and outcomes**

KazMUCE involved stakeholders in development and informed a wide range of teachers and staff about its mission, which aims to ensure the implementation of a policy of training competitive, qualified and academic staff based on the principles of continuous development and the triunity of education, science and practice. EEC members received evidence that most of the staff and students know the Mission, it is posted on the stands, in the classrooms and on the university website, which guarantees transparency and awareness of the mission.

The uniqueness of the KazMUCE mission is in creation of a full cycle of continuous education, starting with Bachelor's degree and ending in the clinical areas – with residency, and in scientific and pedagogical one – with Master's degree, PhD and continuing lifelong learning through additional education programs.

KazMUCE has determined the expected education outcomes that Master's degree students should show after training completion. The outcomes cover opportunities for professional, scientific-research, educative and educational activities, provide opportunities for further postgraduate training in residency / doctoral program, and also create prerequisites for lifelong learning.

#### Strong points of Standard 1 following external evaluation:

1. KazMUCE has created a full cycle of continuous education.

2. KazMUCE introduced in the educational process the credit technology of education.

3. KazMUCE demonstrates the integration of educational, diagnostic and treatment, and scientific areas in the educational program.

4. The educational program has a mission that meets current trends in world and domestic public health;

5. KazMUCE has a clear system for the provision of educational, methodological and resource components for the Master's degree program in "Nursing"

*EEC conclusions on the criteria:* fulfilled - 13, partially fulfilled 0, not fulfilled - 0

#### Standard 1: accomplished

#### **Recommendations for improvement:**

1. In order to strengthen the strategic development and internationalization, to identify a foreign partner university of KazMUCE.

#### **Standard 2: Educational process**

On the basis of an educational license, KazMUCE implements Master's degree educational programs in educational research and profession-oriented areas, the mode of study is full-time, with a distance component. *Master's degree* educational programs are carried out in the following specialties: "Public Health", "Medicine", "Preventive Medicine" and "Nursing".

When developing educational programs, the KazMUCE staff followed the requirements of the SCES RK, SEP and implemented in accordance with the

internal regulatory documents of the university. The experts obtained convincing evidence of the availability of relevant methodological materials on educational programs (teaching materials, syllabuses, KIS, didactic materials).

The participation of students in the development and implementation of the educational program is ensured through a survey, questionnaires.

## **Strong points of Standard 2 following external evaluation:**

1. KazMUCE provides the educational process with academic staff of a high level of professional competence.

2. KazMUCE provides students with the opportunity to choose an individual learning path.

3. KazMUCE applies modern teaching methods aimed at forming in Master's degree students of the responsibility for continuous professional development.

4. KazMUCE demonstrates the integration of theoretical training, scientific components and practical focus.

*EEC conclusions on the criteria:* fulfilled - 17, partially fulfilled - 2, not fulfilled - 0

Standard 2: accomplished

## **Recommendations for improvement:**

1. Actively involve Master's degree students in the evaluation of the educational program.

2. To ensure regular and informative feedback and use its results to improve the educational program and the learning process.

## Standard 3: Assessment of Student Learning

Various methods to assess the achievements of KazMUCE students are used depending on their objectivity and effectiveness. Evaluation of educational achievements in the Master's degree program is carried out in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard and Model Professional Educational Programs in the medical and pharmaceutical specialties of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Individual approaches to the assessment of the outcomes, corresponding to the level of education, have been developed in KazMUCE, for all categories of students. The EEC was ascertain the availability of all internal documents, the maintenance of examination documents, the accounting of formative and summative assessments and the students' opinions on the fairness and effectiveness of different assessment options for their knowledge and skills. The Department of Master's degree and PhD programs of KazMUCE has begun work on completing an electronic journal for Master's degree specialties.

## **Strong points of Standard 3 following external evaluation:**

1. KazMUCE has developed appropriate assessment methods for each level of education, satisfying all stakeholders.

2. KazMUCE evaluates students' educational achievements on the basis of assessment of their knowledge and skills.

3. KazMUCE uses an individual approach in training.

*EEC conclusions on the criteria:* fulfilled - 7, partially fulfilled - 2, not fulfilled - 0

# Standard 3: accomplished

## **Recommendations for improvement:**

1. More actively implement individual, detailed and informative feedback (written review or report) after conducting all types of assessment.

2. To assess the quality and validity of test tasks for all types of control

#### **Standard 4: Master's degree students**

The admission policy for students in all areas of activity is governed by the Regulations, Rules and Procedures developed in accordance with the goals and objectives set for the implementation of educational programs and in accordance with legislative, regulatory and internal documents

The policy and procedures for acceptance of Master's degree student to KazMUCE, specified in the KazMUCE Rules of admission for studying, are clear, consistent with the mission and objectives of the university, officially published and available to all future students (website www.kazmuno.kz, stand and booklet for applicants, etc.).

The EEC received evidence of transparency, legitimacy and compliance with the LSI in admission, selection and enrollment of students in different categories of education. Corresponding original documents (orders, lists, logs, statements) were reviewed.

#### **Strong points of Standard 4 following external evaluation:**

1. KazMUCE has a clear regulated policy of admission and selection of Master's degree students, ensuring the transparency of all stages of this process.

2. KazMUCE demonstrates the existence of an effective system of support and consultation for Master's degree students.

3. KazMUCE provided a balanced feedback system with Master's degree students.

*EEC conclusions on the criteria:* fulfilled - 18, partially fulfilled - 1, not fulfilled - 0

#### Standard 4: accomplished

#### **Recommendations for improvement:**

1. Expansion of Master's degree students' academic mobility.

2. To introduce representatives of Master's degree students to the university deliberative bodies.

3. To intensify the publications of Master's degree students and their performance at scientific conferences at the national and international levels.

## **Standard 5: Staffing**

KazMUCE has developed and effectively implements the policy on search, reception and development of faculty. The university has developed and approved the Personnel Management Policy. Teachers with practical experience, as well as teachers working in 123 teaching hospitals, participate in the educational process

of Master's degree programs. The indicator of teacher satisfaction with the work conditions based on the results of a survey conducted by the university was in 2017. - 89%, in 2018 - 82%, in 2019 - 80%. In 2019, the implementation of the KPI system (key performance indicators or KPI) is planned. All types of activities of teachers and staff of the university are analyzed and monitored by deliberative bodies.

## **Strong points of Standard 5 following external evaluation:**

1. KazMUCE demonstrates a high level of academic degree holders rate.

2. KazMUCE faculty has a high Hirsch index.

3. KazMUCE academic staff has a high clinical qualification level (highest or first medical category is mandatory).

4. KazMUCE faculty teaches in 3 languages (state, Russian and English).

5. KazMUCE has a number of regulatory documents aimed at the support and development of academic staff, its timely training, motivation and security

*EEC conclusions on the criteria:* fulfilled - 11, partially fulfilled - 1, not fulfilled - 0

Standard 5: accomplished

## **Recommendations for improvement:**

1. To intensify the teachers' academic mobility programs.

2. To expand the advanced training of academic staff in the countries of near and far abroad.

3. To expand opportunities for faculty to learn English and maintain language competence.

4. To intensify the publication of academic staff in peer-reviewed journals.

#### Standard 6: Educational resources, settings and scholarship

The University has a developed material and technical base for the implementation of Master's degree educational programs. The University administration allocates, from the university budget, the necessary funds for the continuous improvement of material and technical base that are spent on capital and current repairs, technical equipment of educational, scientific and informational activities, the purchase of furniture and teaching equipment, maintenance of utilities and networks of the buildings and registration of buildings and structures. KazMUCE has its own library, a Center of practical and communication skills, a Testing center and distance learning technologies. The university concluded 123 contracts with teaching hospitals for the implementation of educational programs. The university has concluded contracts and memorandums with 31 medical and scientific educational organizations from the countries of near and far abroad. After visiting 3 teaching hospitals of KazMUCE, the EEC received evidence of the effective use of the material and technical base of the university in the educational process and close cooperation with practical health care.

#### Strong points of Standard 6 following external evaluation:

1. KazMUCE has a developed material and technical base and provides a safe education environment.

*EEC conclusions on the criteria:* fulfilled - 22, partially fulfilled - 2, not fulfilled - 0

## Standard 6: accomplished Recommendations for improvement:

1. Further improvement of the material and technical base of the university.

2. To strengthen the material security of the library with new and modern educational literature on nursing.

## Standard 7: Monitoring and evaluation of the educational process

KazMUCE conducts continuous monitoring of the quality of the educational process to analyze the degree and completeness of the implementation of educational standards, the compliance of the operational goals of the university with the strategic development plan, as well as the qualification requirements for the faculty to prepare a competitive professional. The university has developed a system for evaluating educational programs, which provides for the evaluation of programs at the stages of planning, implementing, analyzing results and amending, which allows monitoring the progress of the educational program and students' progress. The monitoring and evaluation system of the educational program is carried out at all levels and includes departments, the Training Center, Specialized Methodological Commissions for Disciplines, Educational Program Committees and the Educational Activities Committee.

## **Strong points of Standard 7 following external evaluation:**

1. In KazMUCE there is a system of evaluation of educational programs at all levels: methodological, provision of faculty, material and technical base.

2. KazMUCE systematically conducts feedback on the evaluation of educational programs.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** fulfilled - 10, partially fulfilled - 1, not fulfilled - 0

Standard 7: accomplished

## **Recommendations for improvement:**

1. To develop, implement and systematically apply evaluation mechanisms of educational program, for its improvement.

2. To strengthen the participation of Master's degree students and practical public health in the evaluation of the educational program

3. To more broadly present the results of the evaluation of the educational program and plans for its improvement.

## Standard 8: Governance and administration

The KazMUCE organizational structure, which includes the governing bodies (Board of Directors; Collegial executive body - the Board), was developed and approved in 2018, but is systematically updating in order to improve management processes. The members of the EEC conducted interviews with almost all

executives, starting with the rector and ending with the heads of key departments (core and providing the educational process), which provided evidence of effective management of all areas of the university (education, clinic, science, social work). The university management is transparent and corporate. Participation of stakeholders in the work of KazMUCE collegiate bodies allows taking into account the interests of practical health care while providing services. In KazMUCE, the determination of the main priorities for spending money is approved by the Board of Directors and the highest collegial body of the university - the Academic Council. Profit is generated from revenues from the state budget, paid types of educational activities, training and retraining of personnel, and scientific activities. The expenditure part of the university budget is formed from salary payments, settlements with the budget for mandatory types of payment, university maintenance costs, the acquisition of scientific and methodological literature, assets, economic and other expenses.

## **Strong points of Standard 8 following external evaluation:**

1. KazMUCE demonstrates the transparency of the management and decisions making system.

2. KazMUCE demonstrates a stable financial condition of the university.

3. KazMUCE provides extensive cooperation with partners in the health sector.

*EEC conclusions on the criteria:* fulfilled - 8, partially fulfilled - 1, not fulfilled - 0

#### Standard 8: accomplished

#### **Recommendations for improvement:**

1. To improve the mechanisms for financing academic mobility of faculty and Master's degree students.

## Standard 9: Continuous renewal

Analysis of the improvement processes undertaken by the university in all areas of activity, and in accordance with the Accreditation Standards 1-8, shows certain success of KazMUCE. For example: expanding the range of Master's degree educational programs, increasing numbers of contracts with teaching hospitals, admissions of teachers to general educational and basic medical disciplines, purchasing of the necessary equipment. The basis for the improvement is the KazMUCE Strategic Plan for 2018-2022 and monitoring of its implementation. For this purpose, KazMUCE has established the following departments: the Academic Council, the Educational Methodological Board, the Dissertation Council, the Clinical Council, the Local Ethics Commission, the Young Scientists Council, the Development Strategy Department and the MCT and the Quality Management Service.

## **Strong points of Standard 9 following external evaluation:**

1. KazMUCE ensures development of professional and pedagogical competencies of university academic staff.

2. KazMUCE offers its graduates the opportunity to continue their studies in residency and PhD programs.

*EEC conclusions on the criteria:* fulfilled - 5, partially fulfilled - 0, not fulfilled - 0

#### Standard 9: accomplished Recommendations for improvement:

1. To continue the improvement of the material, technical and educational base of the university departments.

2. To implement a trilingual education program.

3. To expand opportunities for academic mobility and advanced training of faculty.

# 4. Recommendations for improving the Master's degree program in "Nursing" KazMUCE:

1. To intensify the programs of academic mobility of Master's degree students and teachers and improve the mechanisms for their financing.

2. To introduce representatives of Master's degree students to the university deliberative bodies.

3. To strengthen the participation of Master's degree students and representatives of practical public health in the evaluation of the educational program

4. To ensure regular and informative feedback and use of its results to improve the educational program and the learning process.

5. To intensify the publications of Master's degree students and their performance at scientific conferences at the national and international levels.

6. To expand the possibilities for teaching English and maintaining the language competence of teachers of the Master's degree program

7. To strengthen the material security of the library with modern educational literature on nursing.

# 7. Recommendation to the Accreditation Council of ECAQA

Members of EEC reached common ground to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit Master's degree educational program 6M110100 "Nursing" of Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education JSC for a period of 5 years.

EEC Chair	Balmukhanova Aygul Vladimirovna	
EEC members:		
International expert	Pozdeeva Tatyana Vasilievna	
National academic experts	Kalieva Sholpan Sabataevna	
Expert – Representative of practical healthcare	Abdrasylov Rashid Bolatovich	
Expert-Master's degree student	Syzdykova Aziza Birzhankyzy	
ECAQA observer	Sarsenbaeva Saule Sergazievna	

#### 7. Рекомендация Аккредитационному совету ЕЦА

Члены ВЭК пришли к единогласному мнению рекомендовать Аккредитационному совету аккредитовать образовательную программу по специальности магистратуры 6М110100 «Сестринское дело» АО «Казахский Медицинского Университет Непрерывного Образования» на период 5 лет.

Председатель ВЭК	Балмуханова Айгуль Владимировна	6)
Члены ВЭК:		11
Зарубежный эксперт	Поздеева Татьяна Васильевна	A'
Национальный академический эксперт	Калиева Шолпан Сабатаевна	-Ce
Эксперт-представитель практического		(A)
здравоохранения	Абдрасулов Рашид Болатович	
Эксперт-магистрант	Сыздыкова Азиза Биржанкызы	_omb
Наблюдатель от ЕЦА	Сарсенбаева Сауле Сергазиевна	Caa

41

1

0

# Appendix 1.

## Quality profile and criteria for external assessment of KazMUCE for compliance with the Standards for Accreditation Master's Degrees Programme in Medical And Health Professions Education of ECAQA

	Accreditation standard		Evaluation		
Standard		Fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Not fulfilled	
1.	Mission and outcomes	19	1	0	
2.	Educational process	16	2	0	
3.	Assessment of student learning	8	2	0	
4.	Master's degree students	11	1	0	
5.	Staffing	9	1	0	
6.	Educational resources, settings and scholarship	4	0	0	
7.	Monitoring and evaluation of educational process	8	0	0	
8.	Governance and administration	19	0	0	
9.	Continuous renewal	4	0	0	
	Total	98	7	0	